
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
DALLA LANA SCHOOL OF PUBLIC HEALTH
INTERSECTIONALITY, INEQUITY, AND PUBLIC HEALTH (CHL5128H)
FALL TERM 2016

INTERSECTIONALITY, INEQUITY, AND PUBLIC HEALTH
Critical Foundations and Contemporary Applications



Alana Boltwood. (2013). *Axes of Power*. Acrylic & paper on canvas, 56"x72".
Shown at the *International Conference on Intersectionality*,
Simon Fraser University, Vancouver, British Columbia, April 2014.

INSTRUCTOR: Professor Daniel Grace
Social and Behavioural Health Sciences,
Dalla Lana School of Public Health, University of Toronto
Room 556, 155 College Street, Toronto, ON, M5T 3M7, Canada
Tel: 416 978-6505
Email: Daniel.Grace@utoronto.ca

SEMINAR TIME & LOCATION: Mondays, 2:00-5:00pm
Room: 715 (Health Sciences, 155 College Street)
Appointments: By Request

COURSE DESCRIPTION:

Intersectionality researchers emphasize the need to consider complex interactions between structures of power and oppression and interconnected aspects of individual and group identity and social location. In this course students will be introduced to some of the historical and theoretical underpinnings of intersectionality scholarship. Conceptual and methodological questions, framings, and applications of intersectionality research will be critically interrogated.

We will begin by discussing literature on why the theory and practice of intersectionality matter to public health research and policy. Next, we will engage in a focused review of foundational work by Kimberle Crenshaw, Patricia Hill Collins, and bell hooks. We will next discuss current conceptual and methodological debates and challenges in this interdisciplinary field. The

remainder of the course will focus on the use of intersectionality in health scholarship including the analysis of health policy and applications of intersectionality in the study of sexualities and HIV/AIDS research across diverse axes of inequity. Our final readings will consider recent travels and critiques of intersectionality.

OPERATIONAL GOALS: Student completing this course will be able to demonstrate:

- Knowledge of key foundational work with focused attention to Kimberle Crenshaw, Patricia Hill Collins and bell hooks
- Understanding of conceptual and methodological challenges when using intersectionality
- Evaluation of current applications of intersectionality in fields of health inequity, health policy and public health
- Ability to apply intersectionality to areas of health research
- Appreciation for current critiques of intersectionality

TARGET AUDIENCE:

- PhD students and second-year Master's students in the Dalla Lana School of Public Health and the Institute for Health Policy Management and Evaluation.

COURSE PRE-REQUISITE:

- Permission of course coordinator

REQUIRED READING MATERIAL:

Collins P.H. (1990). *Black Feminist Thought: Knowledge, Consciousness, and the Politics of Empowerment*. Boston: Urwin Hyman.

hooks, b. (1984). *Feminist theory: From margin to center*. South End Press.

[Copies of this text will be made available for purchase at the University of Toronto Bookstore].

Required readings for each session are listed in this outline. An appendix to this outline is provided on Blackboard that provides an extensive list of additional recommended readings and key journals of interest. Students are encouraged to add to this list of additional readings. Copies of the required readings are posted on Blackboard or will be made available for review prior to class.

EVALUATION:

A. Facilitation (25%)

Each week, from Weeks 3 to 12, students will facilitate/co-facilitate a discussion of the assigned readings. Students will facilitate twice during the semester. This entails providing: (a) an overview presentation, (b) distributing a short handout based on *critical reflections of the readings* to help frame the subsequent discussion and (c) leading/co-leading class discussion. *Additional information regarding facilitation expectations is posted on Blackboard. (2 Facilitations: 1st 10% + 2nd 15% = 25%).*

When facilitating class discussion, you will provide focused discussion questions and:

- *Provide opportunities for everyone to speak and contribute*
- *Encourage discussion of varied opinions and perspectives*
- *Help to make connections across contributions*
- *Listen attentively and asked for clarification as required*
- *Manage any conflict or difficulties in a respectful manner*

B. Written Reflections (20%)

Beginning in Week 2 you will be asked to come to class with 2-3 prepared discussion questions and a short written reflection that *focuses on one of the readings that week*. In your reflection, you are encouraged to make a connection to the weekly readings as a whole (~400-500 words, single spaced). You are responsible for completing at least 4 of these reflection exercises during the semester (*on the weeks of your choice provided that you complete at least 2 reflections by the 6th week of class*) and emailing them to Professor Grace by NOON on the day before class. These reflections should be completed for weeks you are not facilitating. *Additional information regarding reflection expectations is posted on Blackboard. (4 reflections x 5% each = 20%).*

There are at least five purposes for the reflection pieces:

- *to help you prepare for the seminar discussion;*
- *to help me understand your perspectives and understanding of the material;*
- *to give you the opportunity to practice your writing;*
- *to facilitate interaction among students in the class; and*
- *to help document your developing understanding of the material over time.*

C. Final Paper (55%): 2 components: *proposal* and *final paper*.

1. **Paper proposal (15%):** This proposal must focus on a central question related to intersectionality and health inequity. It must outline and describe: (a) your key research question and, if appropriate, sub-questions; (b) the significance of your question for social studies of health; (c) your proposed use of intersectionality in your analysis, and (d) the relevance of your question for your own scholarly and/or professional work.

You will engage the literature relevant to your topic by analyzing peer-reviewed journal articles and major book chapters. Based on your preliminary review of the literature, in your proposal you will also discuss what research remains for you to do in order to develop depth and breadth in relation to your topic. Be as specific as possible in 2-3 pages (not including references), double-spaced, 12-point font with 1 inch margins. *Further details provided on Blackboard. Due date: **October 24, 2016, at beginning of class.** Please submit a hard copy in class and email an electronic copy to Professor Grace by 2pm with the subject line: **CHL5128H Paper Proposal.***

2. **Final research paper (40%):** Papers must be 12-15 double-spaced pages, excluding references (1 inch margins, 12-point font). It is expected that your final bibliography will go beyond the entries in your proposal as you continue to explore the breadth of issues relevant to your topic. *Further details provided on Blackboard. Due date: **December 5, 2016.** Please submit an electronic copy to Professor Grace by 5pm with the subject line: **CHL5128H Final Paper.***

PARTICIPATION: Successful class sessions rely on the presence of engaged students; thus, your punctual and regular attendance is crucial for your own learning, as well as that of others. Students are expected to contribute to class discussion on a regular basis, to have completed the readings prior to class each week, and to bring notes they have made on the readings to class. If you will be absent, please notify Professor Grace in advance.

Late work: Late submission will result in a 5% grade deduction per day. Papers submitted more than three days late will not be accepted. When illness or other special circumstances affect your ability to meet the deadline, notification should be given to Professor Grace as soon as possible and before the deadline in question.

Following the **ASA Style Guide** for text citation and reference lists is **required**.

PLAGIARISM

Students in graduate studies are expected to be familiar with the University's policies on academic integrity and commit to the highest standards of academic practice. This includes understanding the importance of protecting and acknowledging intellectual property. Students are expected to know how to cite references appropriately, thereby avoiding plagiarism. Please refer to following documents for guidance:

How Not to Plagiarize

<http://www.writing.utoronto.ca/advice/using-sources/how-not-to-plagiarize>.

The Code on Behavior and Academic Matters

<http://www.governingcouncil.utoronto.ca/Assets/Governing+Council+Digital+Assets/Policies/PDF/ppjun011995.pdf>.

Plagiarism (the presentation or paraphrasing of the work of another author as if it was one's own) is a form of academic fraud with potentially serious consequences. All university policies regarding plagiarism will be upheld in this course.

TOPICS TO BE COVERED:

Sept. 12, 2016	WEEK 1: INTRODUCTION
Sept. 19, 2016	WEEK 2: INTERSECTIONALITY AND PUBLIC HEALTH
Sept. 26, 2016	WEEK 3: FOUNDATIONAL SCHOLARSHIP 1: KIMBERLE CRENSHAW
Oct. 3, 2016	WEEK 4: FOUNDATIONAL SCHOLARSHIP 2: PATRICIA HILL COLLINS
Oct. 10, 2016	WEEK 5: <i>NO CLASS [THANKSGIVING HOLIDAY]</i>
Oct. 17, 2016	WEEK 6: FOUNDATIONAL SCHOLARSHIP 3: bell hooks
Oct. 24, 2016	WEEK 7: CURRENT DEBATES & DILEMMAS 1: CONCEPTUALIZING INTERSECTIONALITY <i>PAPER PROPOSAL DUE</i>
Oct. 31, 2016	WEEK 8: CURRENT DEBATES & DILEMMAS 2: WHAT METHODS?
Nov. 7, 2016	WEEK 9: INTERSECTIONALITY, HEALTH & POLICY
Nov 14, 2016	WEEK 10: SEXUALITIES RESEARCH AT THE INTERSECTIONS
Nov. 21, 2016	WEEK 11: HIV/AIDS RESEARCH AT THE INTERSECTIONS
Nov. 28, 2016	WEEK 12: CURRENT CONCEPTUALIZATIONS AND CRITIQUES
Dec. 5, 2016	<i>FINAL PAPER DUE</i>

READING LIST

WEEK 1: INTRODUCTION

Required Readings:

Combahee River Collective. (1981, first published 1977). A Black Feminist Statement. In *This Bridge Called my Back: Writings by Radical Women of Colour*, edited by C. Moraga and G. Anzaldúa. New York: Kitchen Table, Women of Colour Press, 210-218.

Recommended Readings:

Lorde. A. (1983/2004). The master's tools will never dismantle the master's house. In C. Lemert (Ed.), *Social theory: The multicultural and classic readings* (pp. 440-443). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

WEEK 2: INTERSECTIONALITY AND PUBLIC HEALTH

Required Readings:

Bowleg, L. (2012). The Problem With the Phrase *Women and Minorities: Intersectionality—an Important Theoretical Framework for Public Health*. *American Journal of Public Health* 102(7): 1267-1273.

Dhamoon, R. K., & Hankivsky, O. (2011). Why the theory and practice of intersectionality matter to health research and policy. *Health inequities in Canada: Intersectional frameworks and practices*, 16-50.

Hankivsky, O., & Christoffersen, A. (2008). Intersectionality and the determinants of health: a Canadian perspective. *Critical Public Health*, 18(3), 271-283.

Recommended Reading:

deLeeuw, S., & Greenwood, M. (2011). Beyond borders and boundaries: Addressing Indigenous health inequities in Canada through theories of social determinants of health and intersectionality. *Health inequities in Canada: Intersectional frameworks and practices*, 53-70.

Hankivsky, O. (2012). Women's health, men's health, and gender and health: Implications of intersectionality. *Social Science & Medicine*, 74(11), 1712-1720.

Weber, L., & Fore, M. E. (2007). Race, ethnicity, and health: An intersectional approach. In *Handbooks of the sociology of racial and ethnic relations* (pp. 191-218). Springer US.

WEEK 3: FOUNDATIONAL SCHOLARSHIP 1: KIMBERLE CRENSHAW

Required Readings:

Crenshaw, K. (1989). Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist Politics. *University of Chicago Legal Forum*, 138-67.

Crenshaw, K. (1991). Mapping the margins: Intersectionality, identity politics, and violence against women of color. *Stanford law review*, 1241-1299.

WEEK 4: FOUNDATIONAL SCHOLARSHIP 2: PATRICIA HILL COLLINS

Required Readings:

Collins P.H. (1990). Chapters 1-2 (pp. 3-40) and 12 (pp. 221-238) in *Black Feminist Thought: Knowledge, Consciousness, and the Politics of Empowerment*. Boston: Urwin Hyman.

Recommended Readings:

Collins, P. H. (1986). Learning from the outsider within: The sociological significance of Black feminist thought. *Social Problems*, 33, 14-32.

WEEK 5: NO CLASS [THANKSGIVING HOLIDAY]**WEEK 6: FOUNDATIONAL SCHOLARSHIP 3: bell hooks**

Required Readings:

hooks, b. (1984). *Feminist theory: From margin to center*. South End Press. (Preface and Chapter 1-4; pp. 1-65).

Recommended Readings:

hooks, b. (1981). *Ain't I a woman?: Black women and feminism*. Boston: South End Press.

WEEK 7: CURRENT DEBATES AND DILEMMAS 1: CONCEPTUALIZING INTERSECTIONALITY

Required Readings:

Collins, P.H. (2015). Intersectionality's Definitional Dilemmas. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 41: 1-20.

Dhamoon, R.K. (2011). Considerations on mainstreaming intersectionality. *Political Research Quarterly* 64(1): 230–243.

Choo, H.Y. & Ferree, M.M. (2010). Practicing Intersectionality in Sociological Research: A Critical Analysis of Inclusions, Interactions, and Institutions in the Study of Inequalities. *Sociological Theory*, 28: 129–149.

Crenshaw, K. (2011). Postscript. In Lutz, H. et al., eds, *Framing Intersectionality: Debates on a Multi-Faceted Concept in Gender Studies*. 221-233.

Recommended Readings:

Winker, G., & Degele, N. (2011). Intersectionality as multi-level analysis: Dealing with social inequality. *European Journal of Women's Studies*, 18(1), 51-66.

Clarke, A. Y., & McCall, L. (2013). Intersectionality and social explanation in social science research. *Du Bois Review: Social Science Research on Race*, 10(02), 349-363.

WEEK 8: CURRENT DEBATES AND DILEMMAS 2: WHAT METHODS?

Required Readings:

Bowleg, L. (2008). When Black + Lesbian + Woman \neq Black Lesbian Woman: The methodological challenges of qualitative and quantitative intersectionality research. *Sex Roles*, 59(5-6), 312-325.

McCall, L. (2005). The complexity of intersectionality. *Signs*, 30(3): 1771-1800.

Kelly, U.A. (2009). Integrating Intersectionality and Biomedicine in Health Disparities Research. *Advances in Nursing Science* 32:2, pp. E42-E56.

Hancock, A-M. (2007). "When Multiplication Doesn't Equal Quick Addition: Examining Intersectionality as a Research Paradigm." *Perspectives on Politics* 5:63-79.

Recommended Readings:

Grace, D. (2014). Intersectionality-Informed Mixed Methods Research: A Primer. Institute for Intersectionality, Research and Policy, Simon Fraser University.

Bauer, G.R. (2014). Incorporating intersectionality theory into population health research methodology: challenges and the potential to advance health equity. *Soc Sci Med.* 110:10-7.

Collins, P. H. (1990). Toward an Afrocentric feminist epistemology. Chapter 11 in *Black Feminist Thought: Knowledge, Consciousness, and the Politics of Empowerment*. Boston: Urwin Hyman.

WEEK 9: INTERSECTIONALITY, HEALTH & POLICY

Required Readings:

Clark, N. (2012). Perseverance, determination and resistance: an Indigenous Intersectional-Based Policy Analysis of violence in the lives of Indigenous girls. *An Intersectionality Based Policy Analysis Framework*, 133-159.

Grace, D. (2013). Intersectional analysis at the medico-legal borderland: HIV testing innovations and the criminalization of HIV non-disclosure. *Situating intersectionality: Politics, policy, and power*, 157-187.

Hankivsky, O., Grace, D., Hunting, G., Giesbrecht, M., Fridkin, A., Rudrum, S., ... & Clark, N. (2014). An intersectionality-based policy analysis framework: critical reflections on a methodology for advancing equity. *International journal for equity in health*, 13(1), 119.

Varcoe, C., Pauly, B., & Laliberte, S. (2011). Intersectionality, justice and influencing policy. In O. Hankivsky (Ed.), *Health inequities in Canada: Intersectional frameworks and practices* (pp. 331-348). Vancouver: UBC Press.

Recommended Readings:

Hankivsky, O., Grace, D., Hunting, G., Ferlatte, O., Clark, N., Fridkin, A., ... Laviolette, T. (2012). *Intersectionality-Based Policy Analysis*. Vancouver, BC: Institute for Intersectionality Research and Policy, Simon Fraser University.

Rogers, J., & Kelly, U. A. (2011). Feminist intersectionality: Bringing social justice to health disparities research. *Nursing Ethics*, 18(3), 397-407.

WEEK 10: SEXUALITIES RESEARCH AT THE INTERSECTIONS

Required Reading:

Aguinaldo, J. P. (2008). The social construction of gay oppression as a determinant of gay men's health: 'Homophobia is killing us.' *Critical Public Health*, 18(1), 87-96.

Meyer, I. H., Ouellette, S. C., Haile, R., & McFarlane, T. A. (2011). 'We'd be free': Narratives of lives without homophobia, racism, or sexism. *Sexuality Research & Social Policy*, 8, 204-214.

Young, J. M. & Meyer, I. H. (2005). The trouble with 'MSM' and 'WSW': Erasure of the sexual-minority person in public health discourse. *American Journal of Public Health*, 95 (7), 1144-1149.

Dean, J. J. (2011). Thinking intersectionality: Sexualities and the politics of multiple identities. In Y. Taylor, S. Hines, & M. E. Casey (Eds.), *Theorizing intersectionality and sexuality* (pp. 119-139). Hampshire, UK: Palgrave Macmillan.

Recommended Readings:

Fish, J. (2008). Navigating queer street: Researching the intersections of lesbian, gay, bisexual and trans (LGBT) identities in health research. *Sociological research online*, 13(1), 12.

Rahman, M. (2010). Queer as intersectionality: Theorizing gay muslim identities. *Sociology*, 44(5), 944-961.

Ramirez-Valles, J. (2007). 'I don't fit anywhere': How race and sexuality shape Latino gay and bisexual men's health. In I. H. Meyer & M. E. Northbridge (Eds.), *The health of sexual minorities: Public health perspectives on lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender populations* (pp. 301-319). New York: Kluwer Academic/Plenum.

Taylor, Y. (2011). Complexities and complications: Intersections of class and sexuality. In Y. Taylor, S. Hines, & M. E. Casey (Eds.), *Theorizing intersectionality and sexuality* (pp. 37-55). Hampshire UK: Palgrave Macmillan.

Bostwick, W. B., Meyer, I., Aranda, F., Russell, S., Hughes, T., Birkett, M., & Mustanski, B. (2014). Mental health and suicidality among racially/ethnically diverse sexual minority youths. *American journal of public health*, 104(6), 1129-1136.

WEEK 11: HIV/AIDS RESEARCH AT THE INTERSECTIONS

Required Readings:

Collins, P.Y., von Unger, H. & Armbrister, A. (2008). Church ladies, good girls, and locas: Stigma and the intersection of gender, ethnicity, mental illness, and sexuality in relation to HIV risk. *Social Science & Medicine*, 67: 389-397.

Doyal, L. (2009). Challenges in researching life with HIV/AIDS: an intersectional analysis of black African migrants in London. *Culture, Health & Sexuality*, 11 (2): 173-188.

Dworkin, S. L. (2005). Who is epidemiologically fathomable in the HIV/AIDS epidemic? Gender, sexuality, and intersectionality in public health. *Culture, Health & Sexuality*, 7(6), 615-623.

Watkins-Hayes, C. (2014). Intersectionality and the Sociology of HIV/AIDS: Past, Present, and Future Research Directions. *Annual Review of Sociology* 40: 431-457.

Recommended Readings:

Ontario HIV Treatment Network. (2013). Intersectionality in HIV and Other Health Related Research. Rapid Response Service. 68.

Logie, C. H., James, L., Tharao, W., & Loutfy, M. R. (2011). HIV, gender, race, sexual orientation, and sex work: a qualitative study of intersectional stigma experienced by HIV-positive women in Ontario, Canada. *PLoS medicine*, 8(11), 1475.

WEEK 12: CURRENT CONCEPTUALIZATIONS AND CRITIQUES

Required Readings:

Nash, J. C. (2008). Re-thinking intersectionality. *Feminist review*, 89(1), 1-15.

Davis, K. (2008). Intersectionality as buzzword: A sociology of science perspective on what makes a feminist theory successful. *Feminist Theory* 9: 67-85.

Lykke, N. (2011). Intersectional analysis: Black box or useful critical feminist thinking technology. *Framing intersectionality: Debates on a multi-faceted concept in gender studies*, 207-220.

Recommended Readings:

Carastathis, A. (2008). The invisibility of privilege: A critique of intersectional models of identity. *Les ateliers de l'éthique*, 3 (2): 23–28.

Campbell, M. L. (2015). Intersectionality, Policy-Oriented Research and the Social Relations of Knowing. *Gender, Work & Organization*.